

### Celestine to Nestorius (CPG 8639)

<i>Reference:</i>	CPG 8639
<i>Incipit:</i>	<i>Aliquantis diebus uitae nostrae</i>
<i>Date:</i>	Aug 10, 430
<i>Greek Text:</i>	ACO 1.1.1:77-83
<i>Latin Text:</i>	ACO 1.2:7-12
<i>Other Ancient Versions:</i>	
<i>English Translation:</i>	FCC: J. Sauer; Price CE #15

Written just after Celestine held a council in Rome at which a letter from Cyril (CPG 5310) and one or more letters of Nestorius (CPG 5665, 5667) were read and discussed. Celestine received letters from Nestorius untranslated and only deliberated them after a Latin translation was produced. He then condemns Nestorius and urges him to swallow his pride and return to the orthodoxy as preached by Cyril.

The English translation below was produced by J. Sauer for FCC with reference to Richard Price, *The Council of Ephesus of 451*.

Caelestinus episcopus Nestorio episcopo Constantinopolitano.	Bishop Celestine to Bishop Nestorius of Constantinople.	Τῷ ἀγαπητῷ ἀδελφῷ Νεστορίῳ Κελεστίνος.
1. Aliquantis diebus uitae nostrae post nefandum et saepe damnatum dogma Pelagii atque Caelestii catholicam fidem quies habuit, quando eos cum suae disputationis sequacibus telo unitae sententiae Occidens Oriensque percussit. Denique sanctae recordationis Atticus, catholicae magister fidei et uere beato Iohanni etiam ad ista successor, eos ita persecutus est pro rege communi, ut his ne standi quidem illic copia praestaretur. Mansit nos post eius exitum sollicitudo uel maxima, cum successor suus utrum etiam in eius fidem succederet, quaereremus, quia difficile est continuari quae bona sunt; nam sibi saepe alternis uicibus aduersa succedunt. Habuimus tamen post hunc, a quo	1. After the heinous and frequently condemned doctrine of Pelagius and Caelestius, peace has held the orthodox faith for not a few days of our life, when the West and the East pierced them through with the missile of a united sentence for those following his reasoning. Then Atticus of holy remembrance, a teacher of the orthodox faith and truly even in this regard a successor to blessed John, thus pursued them on behalf of the universal king, in order that not even the ability to stand there would be maintained for them. The very greatest anxiety awaited us after his death, since we desired to know whether his successor would also follow after his faith, because it is	1. Ἐφ' ἡμέρας τινὰς τῆς ζωῆς ἡμῶν μετὰ τὸ ἀνόσιον καὶ πολλάκις κατακριθὲν δόγμα Πελαγίου καὶ Κελεστίου ἡ καθολικὴ πίστις εἰρήνευσεν, ὅποτε ἐκείνους μετὰ τῶν ἐπομένων τῇ δόξῃ αὐτῶν ἢ τε Ἀνατολῇ καὶ ἡ Δύσει ἀκοντίῳ συμφωνούσης ἀποφάσεως ἔπληξεν. αὐτίκα ὁ τῆς ἀγίας μνήμης Ἀττικὸς ὁ διδάσκαλος τῆς καθολικῆς πίστεως καὶ ἀληθῶς τοῦ μακαρίου Ἰωάννου καὶ εἰς ταῦτα διάδοχος οὕτως ἐκείνους ἐδίωξεν ὑπὲρ τοῦ κοινοῦ βασιλέως, ὥστε αὐτοῖς μηδὲ τοῦ ἐκεῖ ἐστάναι ἀνεσι συγχωρηθῆναι. ἔσχεν ἡμᾶς μετὰ τὴν ἐκείνου ἔξοδον οὐχ ἡ τυχοῦσα φροντίς ἐκδεχομένους πότερον ὁ ἐκεῖνον διαδεξόμενος εἶη αὐτοῦ καὶ εἰς

<p>eramus continuo deserendi, sanctum Sisinnium celebratum simplicitate et sanctitate collegam eam fidem quam inuenerat praedicantem. Legerat profecto simplex sanctitas et sancta simplicitas timendum magis quam alte sibi esse sapiendum, et alibi, altiora scrutanda non esse, et iterum: Si quis aliud praedicauerit quam quod praedicauimus, anathema sit.</p>	<p>difficult to continue in what is good, for the enemies often pursue after alternate changes for themselves. However, we had after him, by whom we were immediately to be abandoned, holy Sisinnius, a colleague honored with simplicity and piety, preaching the faith he had come to know. Certainly, simple piety and holy simplicity has read that it is better to fear than to be proud of oneself [Rom. 11:20], and elsewhere, that it is not higher to investigate [Sir. 3:22], and further: If he has preached different than what we have preached, let him be accursed [Gal. 1:8].</p>	<p>τὴν πίστιν διάδοχος, ἐπειδὴ δυσχερές ἐστιν ἐκτείνεσθαι τὰ καλὰ· πολλάκις γὰρ ἑαυτὰς ἀμοιβαδὸν αἱ ἐναντιότητες διαδέχονται. ἀλλ' ἐσχήκαμεν μετ' ἐκεῖνον τὸν μέλλοντα ἡμᾶς ταχέως καταλιπεῖν τὸν ἅγιον Σισίνιον εὐδοκιμήσαντα ἐπὶ τε ἀπλότητι καὶ ἀγιότητι κοινωνόν, αὐτὴν τὴν πίστιν ἦν εὖρε, κηρύττοντα. ἀνεγνώκει δηλαδὴ ἡ ἀπλὴ ἐκείνη εὐλάβεια καὶ εὐλαβῆς ἀπλότης δεῖν μᾶλλον φοβεῖσθαι ἢ ἰδίας συνέσεως βάθος ζητεῖν, καὶ ἀλλαχοῦ· μὴ δεῖν ἀνερευναῖν τὰ βαθύτερα, καὶ πάλιν· εἴ τις ἄλλο κηρύξειεν παρ' ὃ ἐκηρύξαμεν, ἀνάθεμα εἶη.</p>
<p>2. Hoc tamen exeunte de saeculo, cum se sollicitudo nostra in tantum in quantum ei dominus permisit, extenderet, laetificauit animum nostrum uenientium narratio nuntiorum, quam mox firmavit eorum qui interfuerunt ordinationi tuae relatio collegarum, qui tibi testimonii tantum tulerunt quantum ferri huic debuit qui aliunde uidebatur electus. Tanta ante opinione uixisti, ut tuis te aliena ciuitas inuideret; tanto nunc horrore uitaris, ut tui in aliis uideant qualiter fuerint liberati.</p>	<p>2. Nevertheless, after he departed from the world, after our anxiety increased itself as far as the Lord allowed it, the report of the coming announcements gladdened our spirit, which soon their report of colleagues who were present at your ordination strengthened, who brought to you so great a testimony as it should be carried to one who is chosen from another place. You lived so great in esteem before, that another city envied you for your people; so much now are you shunned with horror, that they look at you among others how they have been freed.</p>	<p>2. ἀλλὰ καὶ τούτου ἐκ τοῦ κόσμου μεθισταμένου, ὡς ἡ ἡμετέρα φροντίς ἐπὶ τοσοῦτον ἑαυτὴν ἐξέτεινε, ἐφ' ὅσον ὁ κύριος ἐπέτρεψε, ἐχαροποίησεν ἡμῶν τὴν ψυχὴν ἡ διήγησις τῶν ἐρχομένων ἀγγέλων, ἣν εὐθέως ἐβεβαίωσεν ἡ τῶν ἡμετέρων κοινωνῶν ἀναφορὰ τῶν παραγενομένων τῇ σῇ χειροτονίᾳ, οἵτινες τοσοῦτόν σοι ἐμαρτύρησαν ὅσον ἐχρῆν τῷ ἀλλαχόθεν ἐπιλεχθέντι. μετὰ τσαύτης πρότερον ὑπολήψεως ἔζησας, ὥστε καὶ ἐφθόνησε τοῖς σοῖς ἀλλοτρίᾳ πόλιν· μετὰ τσαύτης δὲ νῦν ἀτοπίας φευκτέον σεαυτὸν παρεσκεύασας, ὡς τοὺς σοὺς ἐν ἀλλοτρίοις ὄραν ὅπως ἀπηλλάγησαν.</p>
<p>3. Dudum sumpsimus epistulas tuas, quibus in angusto nihil potuimus dare responsi; erat enim in Latinum sermo uertendus. Quod cum, licet sero, facimus, sancti fratris et coepiscopi mei Cyrilli probatissimi sacerdotis per filium meum Posidonium diaconum talia de te scripta suscepimus quibus his qui de tua ordinatione rettulerant, perisse suum testimonium doleremus.</p>	<p>3. A little while ago we acquired your letters, to which we were able to give hardly anything of a response; for the language was to be turned into Latin. But when, even if late, we did, we received such writings concerning you of my holy brother and co-bishop Cyril the most excellent priest through my son Deacon Posidonius from which we lament that the testimony of you has come to</p>	<p>3. πρῶν ἐδεξάμεθα τὰς σὰς ἐπιστολάς, αἷς ἐν στενῷ οὐκ ἠδυνήθημεν ἀποκρίνασθαι· ἔδει γὰρ τὸν λόγον εἰς Ῥωμαϊκὸν μεταβληθῆναι. ὅπερ ὡς βραδέως διὰ τὴν ἀνάγκην ποιούμεν, ἐδεξάμεθα τοιαῦτα περὶ σοῦ γράμματα τοῦ ἁγίου ἀδελφοῦ καὶ συνεπισκόπου μου Κυρίλλου τοῦ δοκιμωτάτου ἱερέως διὰ τοῦ υἱοῦ μου Ποσειδωνίου τοῦ διακόνου,</p>

<p>Bonis enim principiis tuis malus, quantum uidemus, successit euentus, bonis inquam principiis, quae apud nos ita celebrata fuerant, ut responsum dantes ad relationem fratrum, nos faceremus participes gaudiorum; sed considerantes nunc et querellam de te praedicti fratris et interpretatas tandem epistulas tuas aperta blasphemia continentis, illud nobis apostolicum uidemus esse dicendum: <b>Vellem mutare uocem meam, quia confundor in uobis.</b> Quin immo mutauī, nisi de praecipiti se reuocet impius disputator; necesse est enim malum ex nobis ipsis, sicut praecipitur, auferamus.</p>	<p>nothing from those who reported concerning your ordination. For as much as we see an evil occurrence has followed after your good beginnings—I say good beginnings, which have been celebrated in this way, that giving an answer to the report of brothers, we became participants of their joys—but now inspecting both the complaint of what was said about you by a brother and your finally translated letters consisting of bare blasphemies, we see that this apostolic phrase shall be spoken by us, “I wish to change my speech because I am confused about you [Gal. 4:20].” Rather I have changed, unless the wicked quarreler calls himself down from the precipice; for it is necessary that we remove the wicked one from even ourselves, as it is directed [1 Cor. 5:12].</p>	<p>ἀφ’ ὧν σφόδρα ἐλυπήθημεν ἀπολωλέναι τῶν περὶ σοῦ ἀνευεγκόντων τὴν μαρτυρίαν. καλὰς γὰρ σου τὰς ἀρχὰς κακῆ, ὡς ὀρώμεν, ἀπόβασις διεδέξατο, καλὰς φημί ἀρχὰς τὰς παρ’ ἡμῖν οὕτω φημισθείσας, ὡς δεῖξαι ἡμᾶς ἐν τῇ ἀποκρίσει τῇ πρὸς τὴν ἀναφορὰν τῶν ἀδελφῶν ὅπως ἡμεῖς κοινωνοὶ τῆς χαρᾶς· ἀλλὰ νῦν ἐννοοῦντες καὶ τὴν περὶ σοῦ μέμψιν τοῦ προειρημένου ἀδελφοῦ καὶ τὰς σὰς ἐπιστολὰς ἐρμηνευθείσας, αἴτινες φανερὰς περιέχουσι βλασφημίας, ὀρώμεν ὅτι λεκτέον παρ’ ἡμῶν τὸ ἀποστολικὸν ἐκεῖνο· <b>ἤθελον ἀλλάξαι μου τὴν φωνήν, ὅτι καταισχύνομαι ἐν ὑμῖν.</b> μᾶλλον δὲ ἤλλαξα, εἰ μὴ ἑαυτὸν ἀπὸ τοῦ κρημοῦ ἀνακαλέσειεν ὁ ἀσεβὴς προσομιλητῆς· ἀνάγκη γάρ ἐστιν ἵνα ἀφ’ ἡμῶν αὐτῶν τὸ κακόν, ὥσπερ ἐκελεύσθη, ἀποστήσωμεν.</p>
<p>4. Legimus ergo epistularum tenorem et eos libros quos illustri uiro filio meo Antiocho reddente suscepimus. In his quidem nobis uestigatus deprehensus et tentus quodam multiloquio labebaris, dum uera inuoluis obscuris, rursus utraque confundens uel confiteris negata uel niteris negare confessa; sed in epistulis tuis apertam non tam de fide nostra quam de te tulisti sententiam, uolens de deo uerbo aliter quam fides habet omnium, disputare.</p>	<p>4. Therefore, we read the tenor of the letters and those books as an evident poison which we received being delivered by my son Antiochus. Indeed you, investigated, understood, and bound by us in these slipped away with a certain talkativeness, while you wrap truths in obscure words, on the other hand also confusing both, whether you confess the things rejected or endeavor to deny the things confessed; but in your letters you brought forth a bare judgment not so much concerning your faith as concerning you, willing to dispute concerning God the Word in a different way than the faith of all holds.</p>	<p>4. Ἀνέγνωμεν τοίνυν τῶν ἐπιστολῶν τὸ ὕφος καὶ τὰς βίβλους τοῦ μεγαλοπρεπεστάτου ἀνδρὸς τοῦ υἱοῦ ἡμῶν Ἀντιόχου ἀποδιδόντος ὑπεδεξάμεθα. ἐπὶ ταύταις ἀνιχνευθεὶς μὲν ἡμῖν καὶ εὑρεθεὶς καὶ κατασχεθεὶς, πολυλαλῆσαι τινὶ ἐξωλίσθαι, τάληθῆ τοῖς σκοτεινοῖς ἐγκαλύπτων καὶ πάλιν συγχέων ἑκάτερα τῷ ὁμολογεῖν μὲν τὰ ἀρνηθέντα, ἐπιχειρεῖν δὲ ἀρνεῖσθαι τὰ ὠμολογημένα· ἐν δὲ ταῖς σαῖς ἐπιστολαῖς φανεράν ἀπόφασιν οὐχ οὕτως περὶ τῆς ἡμετέρας πίστεως ὡς περὶ σεαυτοῦ ἐξήνεγκας, θέλων περὶ τοῦ θεοῦ λόγου ἄλλως κηρῦξαι ἢ περὶ πάντων πίστις ἔχει.</p>
<p>5. Ecce [nunc] in quam de te uocamur sententiam; ecce quae tuarum sunt beneficia nouitatum. Postquam ignoratus electus es et cognitus accusaris, iam nunc cum illo gentium doctore dicendum est: <b>Nam quid oremus secundum</b></p>	<p>5. [Now] behold, the judgment by which we are urged concerning you; behold what the benefits of your newness are. After you were elected while unknown and you were accused while known, so now it ought to be said with that</p>	<p>5. ἰδοὺ νῦν εἰς οἴαν καλούμεθα ἀπόφασιν περὶ σοῦ· ἰδοὺ οἳαί εἰσιν αἱ εὐεργεσίαι τῶν σῶν καινοτήτων. ἀφ’ οὗ ἀγνωστούμενος μὲν ἐπελέχθης, γνωσθεὶς δὲ κατηγορήθης, λοιπὸν μετὰ τοῦ τῶν ἐθνῶν</p>

<p><b>quod oportet, nescimus.</b> Nonne haec ecclesiae illi uerba conueniunt quae probatos sibi uiros, non notitiam tuam sed famam secuta, contempsit? Inpositum est opinioni bene de te credentium. Quis enim intra ouile uellus rapacem lupum putaret abscondi? Vox est eiusdem apostoli, <b>oportere etiam haereses esse, ut probati manifesti fiant.</b> Aperi aures tuas, et eius ad Timotheum uel Titum dictos audito sermones: Quid his aliud praecepit quam ut nouitates uitent uocum profanas? Ad impietatem quippe ista proficiunt quae semper spinas et tribulos intulerunt. Timotheum certe etiam rogasse se dicit ut Ephesi remanens denuntiaret quibusdam ne quis aliter praedicaret. Ante oculos mihi Hieremiae prophetae uerba sunt: <b>Horribilia, inquit, facta sunt super terram, prophetae iniquitatem prophetant.</b></p>	<p>teacher of the Gentiles, “For we do not know how we pray according to what is proper [Rom. 8:26].” Do not those words fit that church which despised esteemed men for itself following not your acquaintance but your reputation? It has cheated the opinion of those having a good opinion of you. For who thought that a ravenous wolf was concealed within a sheep hide. The voice of the same apostle is that it is necessary for there to be even heresies so that the esteemed become evident [1 Cor. 11:19]. Open your ears, and hear his words spoken to Timothy and Titus. What did he teach to them other than that they should avoid the godless originalities of speech [2 Tim. 2:16, Tit. 3:9]? Certainly, those things which always introduce thorns and thistles advance toward godlessness. He said that he asked Timothy so that he would while remaining behind in Ephesus order certain people not to preach differently [1 Tim. 1:3]. Before my eyes are the words of Jeremiah the prophet, “Horrible,” he said, “are the deeds on earth; the prophets prophesy injustice [Jer. 5:30-31].”</p>	<p>διδασκάλου λεκτέον· <b>τί γὰρ εὐξόμεθα ὡς χρή, οὐκ ἴσμεν.</b> ἄρα οὐ ταῦτα τὰ ῥήματα ἐκείνη τῇ ἐκκλησίαι πρέπει, ἥτις δεδοκιμασμένων ἐν αὐτῇ ἀνθρώπων κατεφρόνησεν, ἀκολουθήσασα τῇ σῆ φήμῃ, οὐ τῇ γνώσει; ἠπατήθη ἡ ὑπόνοια τῶν καλῶς περὶ σοῦ πιστευσάντων. τίς γὰρ ἐντὸς προβατείου μαλλοῦ ἄρπαγα κεκρύφθαι λύκον νομίσει; φωνὴ ἐστὶν αὐτοῦ τοῦ ἀποστόλου <b>δεῖν καὶ αἱρέσεις εἶναι, ἵνα οἱ δεδοκιμασμένοι φανεροὶ ᾧσιν.</b> ἀνοιγέ σου τὰς ἀκοὰς καὶ τούτου τοὺς πρὸς Τιμόθεον καὶ Τίτον ἄκουε λόγους· τί ἄλλο κελεύει ἢ ἵνα τὰς βεβήλους καινότητος τῶν φωνῶν ἀποστρέφονται; ταῦτα γὰρ εἰς ἀσέβειαν προχωρεῖ, ἅπερ αἰεὶ ἀκάνθας καὶ τριβόλους ποιεῖ. τὸν δὲ Τιμόθεον καὶ παρακεκληκέναι αὐτόν φησιν, ἵνα τῇ Ἐφέσῳ παραμένων παραγγείλῃ τισὶ μὴ τις ἄλλο κηρύξῃ. πρὸ ὀφθαλμῶν μοί ἐστι τὰ ῥήματα Ἱερεμίου τοῦ προφήτου· <b>φοβερά, φησίν, ἐγένετο ἐπάνω τῆς γῆς· οἱ προφῆται ἀδικίαν προφητεύουσι.</b></p>
<p>6. Haec, dicas uolo, quasi ignota te transeunt aut quasi nota contemnis? Si quasi ignota te transeunt, non sit pudoris rectum discere, quando timori non fuit docere peruersum; si quasi nota contemnis, intellege te inexcusabilem fore, cum a te commissi tibi talenti quaesierit ille rationem qui per nos de hoc sancto fenore suo lucrum semper expectat. Aspice quae poena illum maneat qui abscondit acceptum, qui integrum certe restituit quod accepit. Unde euidenter aduerte quod sit et quale periculum nec hoc quod acceperis, reddidisse.</p>	<p>6. I wish you to tell me, is it as if these unknown things are passing over you or is it as if you are despising known things? If it is as if unknown things pass over you, do not have shame to learn what is correct, since you were not afraid to teach what is evil; if it is as if you despise known things, know that it will be inexcusable for you, when he searches from you for an account of the talent entrusted to you who through us always expects a profit concerning this your holy interest. See what punishment remains for him who hides the received sum, who certainly</p>	<p>6. ταῦτα, εἰπέ μοι, ὡς ἄγνωστα σε παρέρχεται ἢ ὡς ἐγνωσμένων καταφρονεῖς; εἰ μὲν ὡς ἄγνωστά σε παρέρχεται, μὴ αἰδεσθῆς μαθεῖν τὸ ὀρθόν, ὡς οὐκ ἐφοβήθης τὸ διεστραμμένον διδάξαι· εἰ δὲ ὡς ἐγνωσμένων καταφρονεῖς, νόει ὅτι ἀναπολόγητά σοι ἔσται, ὅταν ἀπὸ σοῦ τοῦ ἐπιτραπέντος σοι ταλάντου τὸν λόγον ἐκεῖνος ἐπιζητήσῃ, ὃς δι' ἡμῶν ἀπὸ τούτου τοῦ ἁγίου δανείσματος ἑαυτοῦ αἰεὶ κέρδος ἐκδέχεται. ὅρα οἷα τιμωρία ἐκεῖνον μένει τὸν κρύψαντα ὅπερ εἰλήφει, ἔτι γε μὴν τὸν ὀλόκληρον ἀποκαταστήσαντα ὅπερ</p>

	returns the untouched talent which he received [Mt. 25:24f]. So, evidently pay attention to what and of what sort of danger this is because what you have received has not been returned.	εὐλήφει. ὅθεν φανερώς πρόσεχε ὅσος καὶ οἶος ὁ κίνδυνος μηδὲ ὅπερ ἔλαβες, ἀποδιδόναι.
7. An tu domino nostro dicturus es: Quos dedisti mihi, custodiui, cum sic scindi in partes audiamus eius ecclesiam? Qua conscientia uiuis paene ab omnibus in hac ciuitate desertus? Optaueram eos tunc fuisse tam cautos quam nunc sunt, cum sibi desiderant subueniri. Unde tibi in has quaestiones uerba dirigere quas sit blasphemium cogitasse? Unde in populos haec episcopo praedicare quibus uirginei partus reuerentia saucietur? Non debent ueteris fidei puritatem blasphema in deum uerba turbare. Quis umquam non dignus est anathemate iudicatus uel adiciens uel retrahens fidei? Plene etenim et manifeste tradita ab apostolis nobis nec augmentum nec imminutionem requirit. Legimus libris nostris non addi debere, non retrahi; magna quippe et addentem et retrahentem poena constringit.	7. Or perhaps are you about to say to our Lord, “What you have given me, I have kept [John 17:12],” when we hear that you have divided his church into parts like this? With what conscience do you live having been deserted by nearly all in this city? I had wished that they had been as on guard as they are now, when they long to be relieved. Where does it come from for you that you direct the words into those investigations which had been considered blasphemy? Where is it from that a bishop preaches to his people about things which injure the respect of the virgin birth? Words reviling to God ought not to confuse the purity of the old faith. Who at any time was not worthy of anathema being judged either adding to or taking away from the faith? For truly what has been completely and manifestly handed down to us from the apostles seeks neither an increase nor a lessening. We read that nothing ought to be added to our books, nor taken away; surely a great punishment restrains both the one adding and taking away [Rev. 22:18f].	7. ἄρα σὺ τῷ δεσπότη ἡμῶν ἐρεῖς· οὐς δέδωκάς μοι, ἐφύλαξα, ὅποτε οὕτως ἀκούομεν σχιζέσθαι εἰς μέρη τὴν ἐκκλησίαν αὐτοῦ; μεθ’ οἷας συνειδήσεως ζῆς, σχεδὸν ὑπὸ πάντων τῶν ἐν ταύτῃ τῇ πόλει καταλειφθεῖς; ἠύχόμεν αὐτοὺς τότε μᾶλλον γεγενῆσθαι ἀσφαλεῖς ἢ νῦν εἰσιν, ὅτε ἑαυτοῖς ἐπιζητοῦσι βοήθειαν. πόθεν σοι εἰς τοιαῦτα ζητήματα ἰθύνειν λόγους, ἅπερ ἐννοεῖν βλάβσημον; πόθεν ἐπισκόπῳ ταῦτα εἰς δῆμους κηρύττειν, δι’ ὧν τὸ σέβας τοῦ παρθενικοῦ τόκου τιτρώσκεται; οὐκ ὀφείλουσι τῆς ἀρχαίας πίστεως τὴν καθαρότητα βλάβσημοι εἰς τὸν θεὸν λόγοι διαταράξαι. τίς πώποτε οὐκ ἄξιός τοῦ ἀναθεματισθῆναι ἐκρίθη ἢ ἀφαιρῶν τι ἢ προστιθεῖς τῇ πίστει; τὰ γὰρ μεστῶς καὶ φανερώς παραδοθέντα ἡμῖν παρὰ τῶν ἀποστόλων οὔτε προσθήκην οὔτε μείωσιν ἐπιδέχεται. ἀνέγνωμεν ἐν ταῖς βίβλοις ἡμῶν μήτε προστιθέναι δεῖν μήτε ἀφαιρεῖν· μεγίστη γὰρ καὶ τὸν προστιθέντα καὶ τὸν ἀφαιροῦντα τιμωρία δεσμεῖ.
8. Unde cauterium paramus et ferrum, quia ultra non erunt fouenda uulnera quae merentur abscindi; scimus certe maiora uitia maiore semper dolore sanari. Inter multa quae a te impie praedicata uniuersalis recusat ecclesia, symbolo ab apostolis tradito plangimus haec uerba fuisse sublata quae nobis totius spem uitae salutisque promittunt. Quod quare fiat, locuntur epistulae tuae, de quibus	8. From which we are preparing the cauterizing knife, because the wounds which ought to be cut off are no longer to be warmed; we certainly know that greater faults are always healed with greater pain. Among the many things impiously preached by you the universal church rejected, we lament that these words from the symbol handed down from the apostles which entirely	8. Ὅθεν καυτῆρα καὶ σίδηρον ἐτοιμάζομεν, ἐπειδήπερ ἐτέρως οὐκ ἐστὶ καταντλητέα τὰ τραύματα, ἅπερ ἐστὶ λοιπὸν ἀποκοπῆς ἄξια· ἴσμεν γὰρ τὰ μέγιστα ἐλαττώματα μετὰ μείζονος ἀεὶ πόνου θεραπευόμενα. ἀλλὰ μετὰ πολλῶν ἅπερ παρὰ σοῦ ἀσεβῶς κηρυττόμενα ἢ καθόλου ἀπωθεῖται ἐκκλησία, κλαίομεν μάλιστα τὸ ταῦτα

<p>nulla dubitatio est quia eas ipse misisti; quas in manus nostras nolueramus uenire, ne de tanti cogeremur sceleris genere iudicare. Omnium disputationum tuarum uias breuis earum sermo conclusit. Extendisti te latius, multis anfractibus circuisti; sero tamen diuerso itinere peruenisti ad impium constitutum. Scimus quid ille cauerit qui praecepit contentiones et pugnas legis esse uitandas: sunt enim, inquit, inutiles et uanae. Quod igitur uanum et inutile iudicatur, nemo dubitet minime profuturum.</p>	<p>give hope to us of life and salvation had been removed. Why that was, your letters say, concerning which there is no doubt because you yourself sent them, which we had wished to not come into our hands, so that we were not gathered to judge concerning so wicked a topic. The brief letter about them concluded the paths of all your arguments. You stretched yourself more broadly, you traveled around many digressions; nevertheless, you arrived late and on a different way to an impious pact. We know what he guarded against, he who ordered that controversies and fights of the law are to be shunned, “For they are,” he said, “useless and empty [Tit. 3:9].” Therefore, what was judged useless and empty, no one doubts it having been least beneficial.</p>	<p>τὰ ῥήματα παρὰ σοῦ ἐπῆρθαι ἀπὸ τοῦ συμβόλου, ἅπερ ἡμῖν πάσης ζωῆς καὶ σωτηρίας ἐπαγγέλλεται τὴν ἐλπίδα. ὅπερ διὰ τί γίνεται, λαλοῦσιν αἱ ἐπιστολαὶ σου, περὶ ὧν οὐδεμία ἀμφιβολία ἐστίν, ἐπειδὴ ταύτας αὐτὸς ἀπέστειλας, ἃς οὐκ ἠβουλόμεθα ἐληλυθέναι εἰς ἡμετέρας χεῖρας, μὴ ἀναγκασθῶμεν δικάσαι περὶ τοῦ εἴδους τοῦ τηλικούτου μύσου. πασῶν τῶν διαλέξεών σου τὰς ὁδοὺς ὁ βραχὺς ἐκείνων περιέκλεισε λόγος· ἠπλῶσας σεαυτὸν πλατύτερον καὶ πολλαῖς στροφαῖς περιῆλθες, ὅψε δὲ ὅμως διὰ διαφόρων ὁδῶν εἰς τὸν ἀσεβῆ ὄρον ἔφθασας. ἴσμεν τί ἐκεῖνος διέταξεν ὁ κελεύσας φεύγειν τὰς ἔριδας καὶ τὰς μάχας τὰς περὶ τοῦ νόμου· εἰσὶ γάρ, φησίν, ἄχρηστοι καὶ μάταιαι. ὅπερ τοίνυν ἄχρηστον καὶ μάταιον κρίνεται, οὐδεὶς ἀμφιβάλλει μακρὰν εἶναι ὠφελείας.</p>
<p>9. Itaque quamuis iam frater Cyrillus secundis te epistulis suis asserat esse conuentum, intellegas uolo post primam et secundam illius et hanc correptionem nostram, quam constat esse iam tertiam, ab uniuersitate collegii et conuentu Christianorum te prorsus esse seiunctum, nisi mox quae male dicta sunt, corrigantur, nisi in eam uiam redeas quam se Christus esse testatur. Male in hunc arma desperatione mouisti qui te super familiam suam uelut fidelem prudentemque seruum permiserat ante constitui; periit tibi huius officii beatitudo promissa. Non solum non das cibum in tempore, uerum etiam ueneno interficis quos ille suo sanguine et sua morte quaesiuit; uenenum namque est sub tuis labiis, quae maledictionis et amaritudinis plena uidemus, cum contra eum qui suauis est, niteris disputare.</p>	<p>9. Therefore, although brother Cyril has now declared that you have been addressed by his second letters, I wish you to understand after his first and second and this our reproach, which is evident to be now a third, that from the whole of the fellowship you have been absolutely separated, unless soon what has been wrongly said is corrected, unless you return onto that way where Christ asserts himself to be [John 14:6]. You turned arms in desperation toward him who permitted you earlier to be stationed over his family as a faithful and prudent servant [Matt. 24:45f]; the promised happiness of his office has perished for you. You have not only not given food at the right time, but also with poison you kill those whom he seeks with his blood and his death, for venom is also under your lips [Prov.</p>	<p>9. τοιγαροῦν εἰ καὶ ὁ ἀδελφὸς Κύριλλος ἤδη σε διὰ δευτέρων ἐπιστολῶν μεθοδευθῆναι φησι, θέλω σε τοῦτο νοεῖν ὅτι μετὰ τὴν πρώτην καὶ δευτέραν ἐκείνου καὶ ταύτην τὴν ἡμετέραν ἐπιτίμησιν, ἣν δῆλόν ἐστιν εἶναι λοιπὸν τρίτην, παντελῶς ἀπὸ τοῦ συνεδρίου ἡμῶν καὶ τῆς τῶν Χριστιανῶν συνόδου ἀπεκλείσθης, ἐὰν μὴ εὐθέως τὰ κακῶς εἰρημένα διορθωθῆ, ἐὰν μὴ εἰς ταύτην τὴν ὁδὸν ἐπανέλθης, ἣν ἑαυτὸν ὁ Χριστὸς εἶναι μαρτύρεται. κακῶς κατὰ τούτου ὄπλα κατ’ ἀνεπιστίαν ἐκίνησας, ὃς ἐπάνω σε τῶν οἰκετῶν ἑαυτοῦ ὡς πιστὸν καὶ συνετὸν δοῦλον ἐπέτρεψε πρότερον καταστῆναι. ἀπώλετό σοι ἡ ὑπὲρ τῆς τοιαύτης ὑπηρεσίας ἐπαγγελθεῖσα μακαριότης· οὐ γὰρ μόνον τροφὴν οὐ παρέχεις ἐν καιρῷ, ἀλλὰ καὶ δηλητηριῶ ἀναιρεῖς οὓς ἐκεῖνος τῷ</p>

	13:3], which we see full of cursing and bitterness, when you endeavor to dispute against him who is sweet.	ἰδίῳ αἵματι καὶ τῷ ἰδίῳ θανάτῳ ἐκέρδανε. δηλητήριον γὰρ ὑπὸ τοῖς σοῖς χεῖλεσίν ἐστι ταῦτα ἅπερ κατάρας καὶ πικρότητος μεστὰ καθορῶμεν, ὁπότε κατὰ τοῦ ὄντος ἡδέος ἐπιχειρεῖς διαλέγεσθαι.
10. Ubi est diligentia pastoralis? Pastor bonus animam suam ponit pro ouibus suis, mercennarius uero est qui eas lupis, dum dimittit, et tradit. Quid hic tu pastor acturus es, qui dominicum gregem pro lupis ipse discernis? Ad quae iam grex sanctus saepta confugiet, si intra ovilia ecclesiae saucietur? Qua futurus est tuitione defensus qui te patitur pro custode raptorem? <b>Et alias</b> , inquit dominus, <b>habeo quae non sunt de hoc ouili, et illas oportet me adducere</b> . Ille alias se promittit adducere, tibi pereunt quas habebas, si quidem certum sit, quotiens ista contingunt, non oues pastoribus, sed magis ouibus perire pastores. <b>Et uocem</b> , inquit, <b>meam audient</b> . Quare? Ut fiat unus grex. Ad illius uocem unus fit grex, ad tuam aut inficitur aut fugatur.	10. Where is the care of a shepherd? A good shepherd lays down his life for his sheep, but a hired worker is one who, while running away, also hands them over to the wolves [John 10:11f]. What are you, the shepherd, going to do here, who yourself scatters the Lord’s flock to the wolves? To what now will the surrounded holy flock turn for refuge, if it is wounded within the sheepfold of the church? How will he who suffered you, a robber, for a guardian be defended with preservation? By what defense will he be defended who suffers you, a robber, in place of a guardian? “And others,” says the Lord, “I have which are not from this flock, it is necessary for me to bring them [John 10:16a].” He promised that he would bring along others. For you those whom you had perished, if indeed it is certain, as often as it happens, that the sheep don’t perish for the shepherds, but rather the shepherds for the sheep. “And they hear my voice [John 10:16b],” he said. Why? In order that it becomes one flock. At his voice the flock becomes one, at yours it is either corrupted or driven off.	10. ποῦ ἐστὶν ἡ ποιμενικὴ ἐπιμέλεια; ποιμὴν ἀγαθὸς τὴν ψυχὴν αὐτοῦ τίθησιν ὑπὲρ τῶν ἰδίων προβάτων, μισθωτὸς δὲ ἐστὶν, ὃς ταῦτα τοῖς λύκοις καταλιμπάνει καὶ παραδίδωσι. τί δὲ σύ, ὦ ποιμὴν, ἐνταῦθα πράξεις, ὅτε τὴν δεσποτικὴν ἀγέλην ἀντὶ λύκων αὐτὸς διασπαράττεις; εἰς ποίους λοιπὸν φραγμοὺς ἢ δεσποτικὴ ἀγέλη καταφυγεῖν δύναται, εἰ ἐντὸς τῶν ἐκκλησιαστικῶν περιβόλων τιτρώσκεται; ἢ ποῖα παραφυλακὴ ἀσφαλῆς ἔσται, ὁπότε σε φάσκει ἀντὶ φύλακος ἄρπαγα; <b>καὶ ἄλλα</b> , φησὶν ὁ κύριος, <b>ἔχω ἅπερ οὐκ ἐστὶν ἀπὸ τούτου τοῦ προβατεῶνος κάκεινα δεῖ με ἀγαγεῖν</b> . ἐκεῖνος ἄλλα ἐπαγγέλλεται ἀγαγεῖν, σοὶ δὲ ἅπερ εἶχες, ἀπόλλυται, εἰ καὶ τὰ μάλιστα φανερόν ἐστιν, ὅσάκις ταῦτα συμβαίνει, οὐ τὰ πρόβατα τοῖς ποιμέσιν, ἀλλὰ μᾶλλον τοῖς προβάτοις τοὺς ποιμένας ἀπόλλυσθαι. <b>καὶ τὴν φωνὴν μου</b> , φησὶν, <b>ἀκούσονται</b> . διὰ τί; ἵνα γένηται μία ἀγέλη. πρὸς τὴν ἐκεῖνου φωνὴν μία ἀγέλη γίνεται, πρὸς δὲ τὴν σὴν ἢ βλάπτεται ἢ φυγαδεύεται.
11. Durum est ut in te de Actibus apostolorum beati Pauli uerba conueniant: <b>Ego</b> , inquit, <b>scio quia intrabunt post discessum meum lupi graues in uos, non parcentes gregi, et ex uobis ipsi exurgent homines loquentes peruersa, ut abducant discipulos post se</b> . Haec a te aliis quam tibi dicta uelimus; docenda enim tibi fuerant, non	11. It is harsh that the words of blessed Paul from the Acts of the Apostles come together in you: “I,” he said, “know that oppressive wolves will come among you after my leaving who will not spare the flock, and from you yourselves men speaking perverse things will rise up in order to carry off disciples after them [Acts 20:29-30].”	11. σκληρόν ἐστὶν ἵνα ἐπὶ σοῦ ἀρμόσῃ τὰ ῥήματα τοῦ μακαρίου Παύλου ἀπὸ τῶν Πράξεων τῶν ἀποστόλων· ἐγώ, φησὶν, οἶδα ὅτι εἰσελεύσονται μετὰ τὴν ἐμὴν ἀναχώρησιν λύκοι βαρεῖς καθ’ ὑμῶν, μὴ φειδόμενοι τῆς ἀγέλης· ἀφ’ ὑμῶν ἀναστήσονται ἄνθρωποι λαλοῦντες διεστραμμένα,

<p>discenda quae dicimus. Nam quis ferat doceri episcopum qualiter esse debeat Christianus? Diligenter aspice in quam condicionem uoceris: incesso, argueris, accusaris. Quid horum conuenit sacerdoti? Duris dura responsio, si tamen uicissitudo est uerbis blasphemia uindicare. An tibi a nobis existimas esse parcendum, cum animae tuae ita ipse non parcas, ut omnibus uelis et praeteritis, et praesentibus et futuris beneficium salutis auferre?</p>	<p>We wish these things to be spoken by you to others rather than to you; for we say that they are things for you to teach, not to learn. For who bears a bishop to be taught how he ought to be a Christian? Look carefully into what condition you were summoned: you were reproached, you were censured, you were accused. Which of these is suitable for a member of the clergy? I answer what is harsh with what is harsh, if indeed it is a change to punish blasphemy with words. Or do you suppose that it ought to be spared for you by us, when you yourself similarly do not spare your soul, that you wish to remove the benefit of salvation from everyone past, present, and future?</p>	<p><b>ἵνα ἀγάγωσι τοὺς μαθητὰς ὀπίσω αὐτῶν.</b> ταῦτα ἠβουλόμεθα παρὰ σοῦ ἄλλοις ἢ σοὶ εἰρησθαι· διδασκῆται γὰρ ἦν παρὰ σοῦ, οὐ μαθητῆται σοὶ ἄπερ λέγομεν. τίς γὰρ φέρει διδάσκεισθαι ἐπίσκοπον ὅπως ὀφείλει εἶναι Χριστιανός; ἐπιμελῶς πρόσεχε εἰς οἷαν αἵρεσιν κέκλησαι· προκαλῆ, διαβάλλη, κατηγορή. τί τούτων ἱερεῖ πρέπει; σκληροῖς σκληρὰ ἀπόκρισις, εἴ τις ἄρα ἐστὶν ἄμυνα λόγους τιμωρεῖσθαι τὰ βλάσφημα. ἢ ὑπολαμβάνεις ὅτι ἡμεῖς σου φεισόμεθα, ὅποτε τῆς ἑαυτοῦ ψυχῆς αὐτὸς οὐ φείδῃ; ὅς πάντας θέλεις τοὺς φθάσαντας καὶ τοὺς παρόντας καὶ τοὺς μέλλοντας ἀφαιρεῖσθαι τὴν εὐεργεσίαν τῆς σωτηρίας.</p>
<p>12. Persequor plane boni domini mei fidelis seruus inimicos, cum propheta adserat eos odio se odisse perfecto; moneor rursus, altero loquente, ne paream. Quem hic ego respiciam? Cui honoris aliquid seruem? quando agitur ut mihi totius spei meae causa tollatur. Ipsius in euangelio uerba sunt domini, quibus ait non sibi patrem, non matrem, non filios, non aliquam necessitudinem debere praeponi. Est enim talis frequenter pietas ex qua nascatur impietas, cum, uincente carnis affectu, caritati illi quae deus est, caritas praeponitur corporalis. Eius intuitu aliquibus saepe deferimus; at cum in hunc tenditur qui est ipsa dilectio, necesse est nec illa seruentur quorum auctor uocatur ad causam.</p>	<p>12. I, a faithful servant of the good Lord, completely pursue enemies, since the prophet declared that he hates them with perfect hatred [Ps. 139:22]; again, I am reminded, from another one speaking, that I shall not yield [Dt. 13:8]. Whom shall I respect here; for whose honor shall I serve another when it is has happened that the reason of my hope is entirely removed for me? The words of the Lord himself are in the gospel, by which it affirms that before him shall not be placed father, nor mother, nor brothers, nor another relationship [Mt. 10:37]. In fact, so frequently it is piety from which impiety is born, when, after the state of the flesh conquers, love of the body is placed before that love which God is. For his consideration we often defer to others; but when he who is love itself [1 John 4:16] is contended in this matter, it is necessary that those whose author is called the cause are not kept unharmed.</p>	<p>12. διώκω δηλονότι τοὺς ἐχθροὺς τοῦ καλοῦ δεσπότου μου δοῦλος πιστός, ὅποτε φησὶν ὁ προφήτης τελείω μίσει τούτους μισεῖν· ὑπομιμνήσκομαι πάλιν ἄλλου λαλοῦντος ἵνα μὴ φείσωμαι. τίني ἐγὼ ἐνταῦθα προσχῶ; τίني δὲ τιμῆν τινα φυλάξω, ὅποτε τοῦτο ὀρῶ πραττόμενον, ἵνα μοι ἀρθῆ ἡ ἀπάσης ἐλπίδος ὑπόθεσις; αὐτοῦ τοῦ κυρίου ἐν τῷ εὐαγγελίῳ ῥήματα ἐστὶν οἷς φησὶν μὴ πατέρα μὴ μητέρα μὴ τέκνα μὴ τινα συγγένειαν ὀφείλειν αὐτοῦ προτιμᾶσθαι. ἔστι γὰρ πολλάκις τοιαύτη εὐσέβεια ἀφ' ἧς ἀσέβεια τίκτεται, ὅτε, νικώσης τῆς κατὰ σάρκα διαθέσεως, ἐκείνης τῆς ἀγάπης, ἣτις ἐστὶν ὁ θεός, ἡ σωματικὴ ἀγάπη προκρίνεται. δι' ἣν πολλάκις &lt;μέν&gt; τιμῶμέν τινας· ἀλλ' ὅτε κατ' ἐκείνου ἐστὶν, ὅς ἐστὶν αὐτὴ ἡ ἀγάπη, ἀνάγκη λοιπὸν κακέιναι τὰς ἐννοίας ἐκβάλλεσθαι, ὧν ὁ ἀρχηγὸς εἰς δίκην καλεῖται.</p>

<p>13. Expergescere tandem, quia non sunt istae dicendae uigiliae quas non exhibes custodiae, sed rapinae. Dormire te uelimus in hoc quod praedicas, et uigilare in hoc quod inpuñas; leuius certe ferremus, si in utraque dormires. Nemo tibi perditus esset, nemo quaesitus; nullo animarum dispendio maereret ecclesia, nullo compendio laetaretur; satius ei esset, si hanc sponso suo ita ut susceperas, resignares. Sed quid multis immoror? Loquente architecto Paulo, <b>frustra per te supraedificatum aliquid quaero, in quo non inuenio fundamentum.</b></p>	<p>13. Wake up finally, because those are not to be called vigils which you do not devote for guarding but for robbery. We wish that you sleep over what you preach and watch over what you attack; we would certainly bear it more easily, if you slept over both. No one would have been destroyed by you, no one procured for you; the church would have mourned for no loss of souls, would have been joyful for no gain of souls; it would have been enough if you resigned her to her spouse thus as you received her. But why do I tarry with many words? As Paul the architect spoke, “Vainly do I seek another one building among you, among whom I do not find a foundation [1 Cor. 3:10f].”</p>	<p>13. ἐξυπνίσθητι ὁπὲ ποτε· οὐ γὰρ λεκτέον ταύτας ἐγρηγόρσεις ἄς ἀπονέμεις οὐ τῇ φυλακῇ, ἀλλὰ τῇ ἀρπαγῇ. ἡβουλόμεθά σε ἐν τούτῃ ᾧ κηρύττεεις, κοιμᾶσθαι καὶ ἐγρηγορέναι ἐν τούτῳ καθ’ οὗ πολεμεῖς· τί δὲ λέγω; φορητότερον ἦν ἡμῖν, εἰ ἐκοιμῶ εἰς ἑκάτερον. οὐδένα ἀπώλλυες, οὐδένα ἐκέρδαινες· ἐν οὐδεμιᾷ ζημίαι ψυχῶν ἢ ἐκκλησία ἐστύγναζεν, ἐν οὐδενὶ κέρδει ἔχαιρεν· ἤρκει αὐτῇ εἰ τῷ ἰδίῳ νυμφίῳ αὐτὴν ὡσπερ παρειλήφεις, καὶ παρεδίδους. ἀλλὰ τί πολλοῖς ἐμβραδύνω; λέγοντος τοῦ ἀρχιτέκτονος Παύλου, <b>μάτην διὰ σοῦ ἐπικτισθέν τι ζητῶ, ἐν ᾧ οὐχ ὁρῶ θεμέλιον.</b></p>
<p>14. Audio uim maximam catholice sentientes, quibus nos communicamus, clericos sustinere, ita ut his etiam ciuitas interdicta dicatur. Laetamur eos praemium confessionis acquirere, sed dolemus quod episcopo persequente. Beatus apostolus Paulus persecutorem praedicatore mutauit: nefas est maximum praedicatorem persecutorem mutatum.</p>	<p>14. I hear that the clergy who are practicing in an orthodox way, with whom we unite, bear great violence, thus that it is said that even the citizenry cannot have anything to do with them. We rejoice that they are acquiring the privilege of a confession, but we grieve that it is by a bishop persecuting. The blessed apostle Paul changed from a persecutor to a preacher, it is most wicked that a preacher change to a persecutor.</p>	<p>14. Ἀκούω βίαν ὑπομένειν τοὺς κληρικούς μεγίστην τοὺς καθολικῶς φρονούντας, οἷς ἡμεῖς κοινωνοῦμεν, ὡς λέγεσθαι αὐτοὺς καὶ τῆς πόλεως ἀποκεκλειῖσθαι. χαίρομεν ὅτι τὸ ἔπαθλον τῆς ὁμολογίας ἐκέρδαναν, ἀλλὰ λυπούμεθα ὅτι ἐπίσκοπος ὁ διώκων. ὁ μακάριος ἀπόστολος Παῦλος ἀπὸ διώκτου εἰς κήρυκα μετηλλάγη· νῦν δὲ μέγιστον ἀσέβημα εἰς διώκτην ἀπὸ κήρυκος μετηλλάχθαι.</p>
<p>15. Digere in numerum retro haereticos qui huiusmodi quaestiones ecclesiis intulerunt. Quis umquam de hoc certamine uictor reuertit? Habes certe tuae ciuitatis exemplum: Paulus ciuis Samosateus occupata Antiochena ecclesia cum aliqua praedicaret, collegit suorum seminum messem. Reliquos inuentores malorum ecclesiis occupatis sententiae censura semper non dispar eiecit; hos quoque haereticos de quibus nos, uelut eorum quae gesta sunt nescius, consulere uoluisti,</p>	<p>15. Separate again into a number the heretics who introduce such inquiries into the churches. Who at any time returned as victor concerning this contest? You certainly have the example of your citizenry: Paul, a citizen of Samosata, having seized the Antiochian church preached a certain thing. He gathered together the harvest of his seeds. An opinion of judgment never dissimilar threw out other inventors of evil from seized churches; also, these heretics concerning whom</p>	<p>15. ἀρίθμει τοὺς πάλαι αἰρετικούς, οἵτινες τοιαύτας ζητήσεις ταῖς ἐκκλησίαις ἐπήνεγκαν. τίς πώποτε ἀπὸ τοιαύτης ἐρίδος νικήσας ἀνεχώρησεν; ἔχεις τῆς πόλεως τῆς σῆς ὑπόδειγμα· Παῦλος ὁ Σαμοσατεὺς ἐπιβὰς τῆς Ἀντιοχείων ἐκκλησίας ὡς τινα ἐκήρυττε, συνῆξε τῶν ἰδίων σπερμάτων τὸ θέρος. τοὺς λοιποὺς τῶν κακῶν εὐρετὰς κατασχόντας τῶν ἐκκλησιῶν αἰεὶ ἢ αὐτὴ στερρότης τῆς ἀποφάσεως κατεβάλλετο· ἀλλὰ καὶ τούτους τοὺς αἰρετικούς,</p>

<p>sedibus suis iniusta dicentes expulit iusta damnatio. Quos illic inuenisse requiem non putamus esse mirandum; inuenerunt enim impiam praedicationem, cuius conparatione se existiment innocentes.</p>	<p>you wished to consult us, as if ignorant of that which they have done, just condemnation expelled them speaking unjust things from their seats. We do not think that it is surprising that they found rest there; for they found impious preaching, of which in comparison they find themselves innocent.</p>	<p>περὶ ὧν ἡμᾶς, ὡς τὰ κατ' αὐτοὺς ἀγνοῶν, ἐρωτήσαι ἠθέλησας, ἐκ τῶν ἰδίων θρόνων ὡς ἄδικα λαλοῦντας καταδίκη δικαία ἐξέωσεν. οὐς ἐκεῖ εὐρηκέναι ἀνάπαυσιν οὐ θαυμάζομεν· εὐρήκασιν γὰρ ἀσεβῆς κήρυγμα, ὅτε ἐν συγκρίσει ἑαυτοὺς ἐνόμισαν ἀνευθύνους.</p>
<p>16. Hoc loco, quia oportunitas sermonis exposcit, tacere non possumus quod stupemus. Legimus quam bene teneas originale peccatum, qualiter ipsam naturam asserueris debitricem et eum debitum merito reddere qui descenderit de genere debitoris. Quid tecum faciunt qui sunt haec negando damnati? Numquam sine suspicione ea quae sibi sunt aduersa, conueniunt; eicerentur denique, si tibi quoque similiter displicerent. Cur tamen ea quae in hos tunc sunt acta, quaeruntur, cum certum sit illinc ad nos catholico tunc antistite Attico gesta, directa? Cur non sanctae memoriae Sisinnius ista quaesiuit? Quia utique sub decessore suo probauerat eos iure damnatos. Defleant infelices spe se hominum fuisse deceptos, quibus iam potuit propter communionem solam paenitentia subuenire. Ecce scire de his incipis, si qua ante nescisti; causam tuam magis modo quam aliorum catholica et festina deliberatione curato, quia conuenienter dicimus: <b>medice, cura te ipsum, qui aliis desideras subuenire.</b> Aegritudinis tuae qualitas non recipit aut praestari permittit indutias.</p>	<p>16. To this point, because the opportunity of speech demands it, we are unable to be silent about what we are amazed at. We read that you rightly hold original sin, just as you preserve that nature itself is a debtor and that he who descends from the debtor's kind justly pays the debt. What are those who are condemned because they deny these things doing with you? Never without suspicion do those things gather which are hostile for themselves; consequently, they would have been cast out, if they were similarly displeasing to you also. Yet why are those things which were done among them at that time asked for, when certainly what happened was distributed from there to us by the orthodox Atticus, then overseer? Why did Sisinnius not seek the things of holy memory? Because at any rate he, under his predecessor, tested those condemned by law. The miserable weep that they are deceived by the hope of man, with whom now he is able to come up near communion only with penitence. Behold, you are beginning to know about these things, if you did not know them before, caring for your cause even more than others' orthodox and quick deliberation that we suitably say, "Physician, heal yourself, who desires to help others [Luke 4:23]." The nature of your sickness does not retain nor permit that a pause be performed.</p>	<p>16. ἐνταῦθα ἐπειδὴ ἡ εὐκαιρία τοῦ λόγου ἀπήιτησεν, οὐ δυνάμεθα σιωπᾶν ὅπερ θαυμάζομεν. ἀνέγνωμεν ὅπως καλῶς πιστεύεις περὶ τῆς κατὰ γένεσιν ἀμαρτίας καὶ ὅπως αὐτὴν τὴν φύσιν δεικνύεις εἶναι κατὰχρεω καὶ τοῦτον δικαίως ἀποδιδόναι τὸ χρέος, ὃς ἀπὸ τοῦ γένους τοῦ χρωστού κατὰγεται. τί μετὰ σοῦ ποιοῦσιν οἱ κατακριθέντες, ὅτι ταῦτα ἠρνήσαντο; οὐδέποτε ἀνυπόπτως τὰ ἐναντία ἑαυτοῖς συμφωνεῖ· ἀλλὰ μὴν ἐξεβάλλοντο, εἰ καὶ σοὶ ὁμοίως ἀπήρεσκον. ὁμως διὰ τί νῦν τὰ κατ' ἐκείνων πεπραγμένα ζητεῖται, ὅποτε δῆλόν ἐστιν ὅτι ἐκεῖθεν πρὸς ἡμᾶς παρὰ τοῦ τότε ἐπισκόπου τοῦ καθολικοῦ Ἀττικοῦ τὰ ὑπομνήματα ἀπεστάλη; διὰ τί μὴ ὁ τῆς ἀγίας μνήμης Σισίνιος ἐζήτησε; δηλαδή, ὅτι ἐδοκίμασεν αὐτοὺς παρὰ τοῦ προηγησαμένου δικαίως κατακεκρίσθαι. κλαιέτωσαν οἱ ἄθλιοι ἐκπεπτωκότες τῆς κατὰ ἀνθρώπους ἐλπίδος, οἵτινες εἰς μόνην τὴν κοινωνίαν διὰ μετανοίας βοθηεῖσθαι ἠδύναντο. ἰδοὺ ἤρξω μαθεῖν περὶ αὐτῶν, εἴ τι πρῶτον ἠγνόησας· ἀλλὰ τὸ σὸν πρᾶγμα μᾶλλον ἢ τὸ ἄλλων καθολικῆ καὶ ἐπιταχυνομένη σκέψει θεράπευε, ὅτι ἡρμοσμένως λέγομεν· <b>ιατρέ, θεράπευσον σεαυτὸν ὁ βοθεῖν ἄλλοις σκεπτόμενος.</b> ἡ ποιότης τῆς νόσου τῆς σῆς οὔτε ἐπιδέχεται οὔτε ἐπιτρέπει δοθῆναι ἀνακαχῆν.</p>

<p>17. Alexandrinae ecclesiae sacerdotis fidem et probauimus et probamus, et tu admonitus per eum rursus senti nobiscum, si uis esse nobiscum. Cui fratri si a te praebetur adsensus, damnatis omnibus quae huc usque sentisti, statim haec uolumus praedices quae ipsum uideas praedicare. Nos contra fas etiam sacerdotes uolumus esse correctos; quibus ut praemissa conuentione consulimus, ita in hos necesse est damnationis sententiam, si abutuntur nostra salubri ammonitione, firmemus. Hoc tamen erit, post damnationem prauae dogmatis plenum correctionis indicium: reuocentur omnes ad ecclesiam qui propter Christum caput eius uidentur exclusi. Reuocentur omnes, quod nisi fiat quod dicimus, eiciendus eiecit. Quamuis in nostra communione sint isti in quos talis cognoscitur exstitisse.</p>	<p>17. We both have approved and do approve of the faith of the holy church of Alexandria, and as for you, having been admonished by him again, agree with us, if you wish to be with us. If an agreement is to be offered by you with that brother, condemning everything which to this point continuously you have thought, we wish that immediately you preach these things which you see him preaching. We also wish, against the law, that even the priests be corrected; as with them we consulted in the preceding meeting, thus it is necessary for us to sustain the sentence of condemnation toward them if they abuse our beneficial admonition. This, however, will be, after the condemnation of crooked doctrine, full of the proofs of correction: all will be called back to the church who were seen to be excluded because of Christ its head. All will be called back, because unless what we say happens, he who ought to be expelled will be expelled, although in our communion there are those among whom such a thing is known to exist.</p>	<p>17. τοῦ ἱερέως τῆς Ἀλεξανδρέων ἐκκλησίας τὴν πίστιν καὶ ἐσχήκαμεν καὶ ἔχομεν δεδοκιμασμένην, καὶ σὺ δι' αὐτοῦ ὑπομνησθεὶς τὰ αὐτὰ ἡμῖν πάλιν φρόνει, εἰ μεθ' ἡμῶν εἶναι θέλεις. ᾧ, ἀδελφέ, εἰ δίδοται παρὰ σοῦ συναίνεσις, πάντων καταγνοῦς, ὧν ἄχρι τοῦ παρόντος ἐφρόνησας, εὐθύς ταῦτα, ὡς θέλομεν, κήρυττε, ἅπερ αὐτὸν κηρύττοντα καθορᾶις. ἡμεῖς γὰρ παρὰ τὸ πρέπον καὶ τοὺς ἱερεῖς ἀνεχόμεθα διορθωθῆναι· ἀλλ' ὥσπερ φροντίζομεν αὐτῶν τῷ πρότερον μεθοδεύειν, οὕτως εἰ ἀποχρήσοιντο τῇ ὑγιεινῇ ὑπομνήσει, ἀνάγκη ἡμᾶς βεβαιῶσαι κατ' αὐτῶν τὴν τῆς καταδίκης ἀπόφασιν. τοῦτο δὲ ἔσται μετὰ τὸ καταγνώναί σε τοῦ φαύλου δόγματος μεστὸν μαρτύριον τῆς διορθώσεως· ἀνακληθῶσι πάντες εἰς τὴν ἐκκλησίαν, οὓς δῆλόν ἐστιν ἀποκεκλειῆσθαι διὰ τὸν Χριστόν, ὅς ἐστι ταύτης κεφαλὴ. ἀνακληθῶσι πάντες, οὓς εἰ μὴ γίνεται ὃ λέγομεν, ὃ ἐκβλητέος ἐξέβαλεν, εἰ καὶ τὰ μάλιστα ἐν τῇ ἡμετέρῃ κοινωσίᾳ εἰσὶν εἰς οὓς ὄφθης τοιοῦτος.</p>
<p>18. Ad clerum quoque ecclesiae Constantinopolitanae uel omnes qui censentur nomine Christiano, qualia necessitas exigit scripta direximus, ut si in peruersae disputationis obstinatione persistis nec haec quae frater Cyrillus nobiscum praedicat, praedicaris, nostro collegio, cum quibus tibi non potest esse communio, te intellegant separatam, scituri et exemplo iam cauti qualiter animae suae decocto et maturo iudicio debeant prouidere. Aperte igitur hanc nostram scias esse sententiam, ut nisi de deo Christo nostro ea praedices quae et Romana et Alexandrina et uniuersalis ecclesia catholica tenet, sicut et</p>	<p>18. Also to the clergy of the church of Constantinople or all who are judged with the name Christian we have sent writings of what sort necessity demands, so that if you persist in the stubbornness of the evil argument and do not preach those which brother Cyril preaches with us, they may come to know that you have been separated from our fellowship with whom it is not possible for you to be in communion, knowing and guarding against the present example in what manner they need to care for their souls with ripe and mature judgment. Therefore, openly may you know that this is our</p>	<p>18. Καὶ πρὸς τὸν κλῆρον δὲ τῆς ἐκκλησίας τῆς κατὰ Κωνσταντινούπολιν καὶ πάντας τοὺς ἐπιγραφομένους τὸ τοῦ Χριστοῦ ὄνομα, οἷα ἀπήτησεν ἡ ἀνάγκη, ἀπεστείλαμεν γράμματα, ἵνα ἐὰν ἐν τῇ τῆς διεστραμμένης διαλέξεως παραμονῇ διατελέσης καὶ μὴ ταῦτα ἅπερ ὁ ἀδελφὸς Κύριλλος μεθ' ἡμῶν κηρύττει, κηρύξης, μάθωσί σε ἀποκεχωρίσθαι τοῦ ἡμετέρου συνεδρίου, μεθ' ὧν σοι οὐ δύναται εἶναι κοινωσία, εἰσόμενοι καὶ τοῦτο καὶ λοιπὸν ὄντες τῷ ὑποδείγματι ἀσφαλεῖς, ὅπως τῆς ψυχῆς ἑαυτῶν προνοεῖσθαι ὀφείλουσι καθηψημένη καὶ πεπεμμένη κρίσει. φανερώς</p>

<p>sacrosancta Constantinopolitanae urbis ecclesia ad te usque optime tenuit, et hanc perfidam nouitatem, quae hoc quod uenerabilis scriptura coniungit, nititur separare, intra decimum diem a primo innotescens tibi huius conuentionis die numerandum aperta et scripta professione damnaueris, noveris ab uniuersalis te ecclesiae catholicae communionem deiectionem. Quam formam ad te nostri iudicii per memoratum filium meum Posidonium diaconum cum omnibus chartis ad sanctum consacerdotem meum memoratae Alexandrinae urbis antistitem, qui ad nos super hoc ipso plenius rettulit, destinavi, ut agat uice nostra quatenus statutum nostrum uel tibi uel uniuersis fratribus innotescat, quia omnes debent nosse quod agitur, quotiens omnium causa tractatur.</p>	<p>judgment, that unless you preach these things which both Romans and Alexandrines and the entire universal orthodox church holds concerning our God Christ, just as also the sacred church of the city of the Constantinopolitans has very well held continuously against you, and this treacherous novelty, which strives to separate that which venerable scripture joins, then within the tenth day to be numbered from the first day of this meeting being made known to you, you will be condemned with an open and written declaration. You will know that you have been cast out from the communion of the universal orthodox church. I have established this form of our judgment against you through my renowned brother Deacon Posidonius with all the papers to my fellow clergyman, the holy, renowned overseer of the city of the Alexandrines, who reported to us about this matter more fully, so that he may act in our stead as far as our decree becomes known either to you or all the brothers, because all ought to learn what is done, as often as this matter is discussed by everyone.</p>	<p>τοίνυν ἴσθι ταύτην ἡμῶν εἶναι τὴν ἀπόφασιν ὡς ἐὰν μὴ περὶ τοῦ θεοῦ τοῦ Χριστοῦ ἡμῶν ταῦτα κηρύξης ἄπερ καὶ ἡ Ῥωμαίων καὶ ἡ Ἀλεξανδρέων καὶ πᾶσα ἡ καθολικὴ ἐκκλησία κατέχει, ὡς καὶ ἡ ἅγια ἡ κατὰ τὴν μεγάλην Κωνσταντινούπολιν ἐκκλησία ἕως σοῦ κάλλιστα κατέσχε, καὶ ταύτην τὴν ἄπιστον καινότητα, ἣτις ἐπιχειρεῖ χωρίζειν ἄπερ συνάπτει ἡ ἅγια γραφή, ἐντὸς δεκάτης ἡμέρας ἀριθμουμένης ἀπὸ τῆς ἡμέρας ταύτης τῆς ὑπομνήσεως φανεραῖ καὶ ἐγγράφω ὁμολογίαι ἀθετήσεως, ἀπὸ πάσης κοινωνίας καθολικῆς ἐκκλησίας ἐκβέβλησαι. ὄνπερ τύπον πρὸς σὲ τῆς ἡμετέρας κρίσεως διὰ τοῦ μνημονευθέντος υἱοῦ ἡμῶν Ποσειδωνίου τοῦ διακόνου μετὰ πάντων τῶν χαρτίων πρὸς τὸν ἅγιον καὶ συνεπίσκοπόν μου τῆς μνημονευθείσης Ἀλεξανδρέων ἱερέα τὸν πρὸς ἡμᾶς περὶ τούτου αὐτοῦ ἐντελέστερον ἀνενεγκόντα ἀπεστείλαμεν, ἵνα τοποτηρῶν ἡμῖν τοῦτο πράξῃ ὥστε τὸ παρ' ἡμῶν ὠρισμένον σοὶ τε καὶ πᾶσι τοῖς ἀδελφοῖς φανερωθῆναι, ἐπειδὴ πάντες εἰδέναι ὀφείλουσι τὸ πραττόμενον, ὅσάκις ἢ περὶ κοινοῦ πράγματος ἢ σκέψις.</p>
<p>Et alia manu: Deus te incolumem custodiat, frater karissime.</p>	<p>And on another hand: May God keep you safe, dearest brother.</p>	
<p>Data iii idus Augusti, Theodosio xiii et Valentiniano iii augustis consulibus.</p>	<p>Dated 3<sup>rd</sup> of the ides of August, during Theodosius the Thirteenth and Valentinian the Third, Augusti consuls.</p>	

*Last updated 11/17/24 JTS*